



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 26

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Tuesday, April 11, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Ducharme, Hon. Member for Bonnyville-Cold Lake, presented a petition from 565 Albertans requesting that Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, be withdrawn.

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, presented a petition from 328 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 340 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 205 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, presented a petition from 257 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, presented a petition from 789 Albertans requesting the introduction of a Bill requiring a minimum of two people on shifts from dark to daylight.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, presented a petition from 3,221 Albertans requesting that a minimum of two people be required to work on shifts from dark to daylight.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, presented a petition from 336 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 236 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 126 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 734 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 69 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 264 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, presented a petition from 215 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 233 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 218 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 218 Edmonton and Sherwood Park residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, presented a petition from 230 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 219 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 239 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 257 Edson and Sangudo residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 396 Edmonton residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, on behalf of Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

On request by Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to introduce legislation requiring a minimum of two people on shifts from dark to daylight.

Hon. Mrs. Nelson, Minister of Government Services:

Responses to questions raised on March 15, 2000, Department of Government Services, 2000-2001 Committee of Supply consideration

Sessional Paper 569/2000

Hon. Mr. Paszkowski, Minister of Municipal Affairs:

2 news releases, the first dated March 22, 2000, entitled "Official Opposition Legislative Priorities Emphasize Strong Communities" and the second dated April 7, 2000, entitled "Capital Region Governance Review Report Supports Long-Range Planning, Not Klein Government's Crisis-Based Tinkering", both prepared by the Alberta Liberal Caucus

Sessional Paper 570/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

3 letters dated April 4, 2000, March 29, 2000, and April 10, 2000, from Debra Morris, Edmonton Presbytery Office, The United Church of Canada, Edmonton, Moira E. Hogg, and Harry B. Chase, both of Calgary, expressing their opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 571/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Report dated April 2000, entitled "Albertans' Views on Bill 11" prepared by Angus Reid Group, Inc.

Sessional Paper 572/2000

Report dated April 11, 2000, entitled "Poll shows Klein's legislature speech failed to bail out Bill 11" prepared by the Canadian Union of Public Employees (CUPE)

Sessional Paper 573/2000

Report, undated, entitled "Insight Research Healthcare Poll, Results from Yesterday - Monday, March 20, 2000" prepared by A-Channel Television

Sessional Paper 574/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Document dated April 11, 2000, entitled "Cost-Benefit Analysis of Trust on Bill 11 Health Care Debate", comparing poll results and expense statistics for Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and the Official Opposition

Sessional Paper 575/2000

News release with attachments dated April 11, 2000, entitled "Time for Ralph Klein and Halvar Jonson to Detail True Costs of Government Propaganda Campaign on Private Health Care" prepared by the Alberta Liberal Caucus

Sessional Paper 576/2000

Invoices and receipts providing details of the costs incurred by the Official Opposition to protect Alberta's health care system

Sessional Paper 577/2000

Partially completed checklist intended for Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, to update Government costs incurred promoting Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 578/2000

Document, undated, entitled "Government Closure of Second Reading on Bill 11 Limits Debate"
Sessional Paper 579/2000

List of MLAs (Members of the Legislative Assembly) not given an opportunity to speak to Second Reading consideration of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 580/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

E-mail message, undated, from Dale F. Levy to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, and letter dated April 10, 2000, from Con Duenler, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 581/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

Letter dated May 2, 1994, from Donald J. Philippon, Deputy Minister, Alberta Health, to Robert H. Reynolds, Parliamentary Counsel, Legislative Assembly, providing responses to questions asked by Mr. Reynolds in his letter dated April 15, 1994, regarding the Gimbel Foundation Act, and expressing concerns regarding the Gimbel Foundation Act
Sessional Paper 582/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Memo, with attachment, dated March 26, 2000, from Brenda Gilboe, Edmonton, to Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, expressing concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 583/2000

Notes dated March 19, 2000, from Ewa Cyganek expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 584/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Letter dated March 14, 2000, from George Keay, Mayor, High Prairie, to Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, requesting that Mr. Mar attend public meetings in High Prairie to discuss the importation of foreign toxic waste for disposal at the Bovar hazardous waste treatment facility in Swan Hills
Sessional Paper 585/2000

Letter dated February 18, 2000, from Richard M. Collier, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, requesting the Government act to stop development of the Spray Valley in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 586/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

102 letters from parents of students at Delwood Elementary School, Edmonton, expressing concerns regarding funding for the public school system

Sessional Paper 587/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Report dated March 23, 2000, entitled "Housing our Homeless" prepared by the Calgary Homeless Foundation, assessing shelter needs in Calgary

Sessional Paper 588/2000

Report dated November 1999, entitled "Working Together to Break the Chains of Poverty" prepared by the South Peace Social Planning Council, presenting the results of the 1999 Round Table on Poverty

Sessional Paper 589/2000

Report dated January 2000, entitled "It's Up To Us!" prepared by the Progressive Conservative National Caucus Task Force on Poverty, presenting observations and recommendations based on hearings conducted throughout Canada on the issue of poverty

Sessional Paper 590/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter dated September 1, 1999, from Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, to Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, in response to Mr. MacDonald's letter of July 7, 1999 concerning fatality inquiries for all Albertans who die while working

Sessional Paper 591/2000

Web page from the Canadian Alliance Party stating that party's policy declaration regarding restoring democratic accountability by allowing free votes in a Legislative Assembly

Sessional Paper 592/2000

Ms Paul, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Castle Downs:

Copy of blank Health Protection Act phone survey, prepared by the Castle Downs Constituency Office

Sessional Paper 593/2000

Copy of blank questionnaire appearing in the Castle News, April 2000, regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, prepared by Ms Paul, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Castle Downs

Sessional Paper 594/2000

Members' Statements

Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose, made a statement regarding the Leaders of Tomorrow Awards recognizing hard work and volunteer efforts of Alberta youth, presented to Melissa Knockleby, Cari McIlduff, Savon Meak Michael Wetsch, and Amy Armstrong, at a reception in Camrose, March 22, 2000, and to Kristine Huot, Chris Kirwin, Cody Soanes, and Shawn Gist at the Reynolds-Alberta Museum, April 10, 2000.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, made a statement regarding the need to replace pine shake roofing at École Maurice-Lavallée and École Marie Poburan, St. Albert, and requesting that the Provincial Government pay for replacement of the roofs.

Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, made a statement regarding Volunteer Week, April 9-15, 2000, acknowledging the Wild Rose Foundation and Volunteer Alberta for coordinating events surrounding Volunteer Week, and recognizing Shannon Davidson, Alisha Mannix, Stephanie Britton, Gillian Hansen and Kurt Duffee, all recipients of the Leaders of Tomorrow Awards held in St. Albert, April 8, 2000.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 207 Provincial-Municipal Tax Sharing Calculation Act — Mrs. MacBeth

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(b), debate adjourned, Mr. Dickson concluding debate on a point of order.

Motions Other Than Government Motions

506. Moved by Mr. MacDonald:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to demonstrate its recognition of the contribution made by parents who stay at home to care for their children by providing support equal to that received by parents choosing other childcare options.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was defeated.

507. Moved by Ms Leibovici:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to further increase the number of beds and improve standards for long-term care facilities and home care services with regard to staffing ratios and levels of service to adequate levels, and ensure that Regional Health Authority boundaries do not become barriers to placement.

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(c), debate adjourned, Mrs. Soetaert speaking.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of Hon. Mr. Jonson

Ms Olsen moved adjournment of the debate on the motion for the previous question, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:27 p.m. until 8:00 p.m.

TUESDAY, APRIL 11, 2000 — 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of Hon. Mr. Jonson

A debate followed on the motion for the previous question.

Mr. Renner moved adjournment of the debate. The question being put, with Mr. Tannas in the Chair, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 28

Broda	Fritz	O'Neill
Calahasen	Graham	Paszkowski
Cao	Hancock	Pham
Clegg	Herard	Renner
Doerksen	Jacques	Smith
Dunford	Johnson	Tarchuk
Evans	Langevin	Woloshyn
Fischer	Lougheed	Zwozdesky
Forsyth	Marz	
Friedel	McClellan	

Against the motion: 13

Blakeman	Leibovici	Nicol
Bonner	MacBeth	Olsen
Carlson	MacDonald	Soetaert
Dickson	Massey	White
Gibbons		

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 2:22 a.m. Wednesday, April 12, 2000, until 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Tuesday, April 11, 2000